

To: Paul Nikolich, Chair, IEEE 802 LMSC
From: Roger Marks, Chair, IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access
on behalf of IEEE 802.16 Working Group

Dear Paul,

Thank you for your considerate and thoughtful comments below. We are pleased that you appreciated our tutorial on "IEEE 802.16 and IMT-Advanced."

We have considered your concerns that "the lack of precise, stable requirements in the PAR Scope may hinder the group from completing the standard in a timely manner." We understand these concerns. We had assumed that the project goals were clearly understood, but we had failed to clearly call them out in the PAR.

As a result of your suggestion, we have made clear and specific edits to the draft PAR. We have added a reference to Rec. ITU-R M.1645, which includes target requirements. We have also called out a set of parameters that define the scope. Even in the absence, for the next few months, of more detailed IMT-Advanced requirements, the parameters we are proposing specify the scope in terms that are rather more specific than is conventional in IEEE 802.

We are submitting a revised PAR and hope that you appreciate the improvements.

We also appreciate your question: "Do you think it would be viable for the 802 WGs to cooperate in developing an 802 wide submission into the IMT-Advanced requirements gathering work through the 802.18 TAG? If yes, would you or someone in your group be willing to take a lead in the activity?"

On this issue, we note that ITU-R might be particularly interested in input from IEEE 802 on LAN and PAN considerations. We are willing to assist with the activity, if 802 believes it is important, but active participation and contributions from the other Working Groups would be required.

On a longer time frame, we would encourage an 802-wide effort to coordinate a proposal or proposals for IMT-Advanced. We would volunteer to help coordinate. We believe that an integrated proposal inclusive of multiple IEEE 802 standards would be a very strong contender for IMT-Advanced. We note that one significant challenge would to ensure that the Layer 2 boundary does not become a barrier to successful integration.

Regards,

Roger

From: Paul Nikolich <paul.nikolich@ATT.NET>
Date: November 14, 2006 10:03:03 AM CST
To: STDS-802-SEC@listserv.ieee.org
Subject: [802SEC] 16m PAR comments
Reply-To: Paul Nikolich <p.nikolich@ieee.org>

2006-11-15

IEEE 802.16-06/070r1

Roger,

Thank you for the extremely informative tutorial last night on the work in the ITU-R concerning International Mobile Telecommunications-Advanced, and the 802.16m PAR. I found the tutorial and discussion it to be very useful.

As I mentioned last night during the Q&A section, the lack of precise, stable requirements in the PAR Scope may hinder the group from completing the standard in a timely manner.

My main concern is the relatively ambiguous "...meet the requirements of next generation mobile networks" in 5.2 Scope and the "...accordance with the requirements defined for the internationally agreed radio interface standards for next generation mobile networks such as IMT-Advanced" in 5.4 Scope.

My suggestion is to reduce the ambiguity of the requirements by having the WG define an appropriate set of specific targets for the high level requirements for the system: peak data rate, distance, station speed, etc. The benefit? In my opinion, it will give the group a better chance to complete its work in a timely manner. This approach seems to have worked quite well for the 802.3 WG.

Lastly, and independent of the PAR, do you think it would be viable for the 802 WGs to cooperate in developing an 802 wide submission into the IMT-Advanced requirements gathering work through the 802.18 TAG? If yes, would you or someone in your group be willing to take a lead in the activity?

Regards,

--Paul

draft P802.16m PAR scope and purpose text are copied below for reference.

5.2 Scope of Proposed Standard: This amendment provides an advanced air interface to meet the requirements of next generation mobile networks. This standard is intended for incorporation into the IMT-Advanced standardization activity being conducted by the International Telecommunications Union - Radiocommunications Sector (ITU-R). The amendment is based on the WirelessMAN-OFDMA specification and provides continuing support for legacy subscriber stations.

5.4 Purpose of Proposed Standard: The purpose of this standard is to update the WirelessMAN-OFDMA air interface in accordance with the requirements defined for the internationally agreed radio interface standards for next generation mobile networks such as IMT-Advanced.